COLORADO TITLE BOARD

In the Matter of:

TITLE, BALLOT TITLE & SUBMISSION CLAUSE FOR PROPOSED INITIATIVE 2021-2022 #16: "LAWS CONCERNING CRUELTY TO ANIMALS"

MOTION FOR REHEARING

In accordance with C.R.S. § 1-40-107(1)(a)(I), the Colorado registered electors signed below hereby request a rehearing before the Colorado Title Board (the "**Board**") with respect to Proposed Initiative 2021-2022 #16, regarding "Laws Concerning Cruelty to Animals" (the "**Initiative**"). As set forth below, Movants respectfully object to the title, ballot title and submission clause approved by the board based on the following:

I. <u>BACKGROUND</u>

Following a hearing held March 17, 2021, the Board designated and fixed the following title for the Initiative:

A change to the Colorado Revised Statutes concerning expanding prohibitions against cruelty to animals, and, in connection therewith, expanding the definition of "livestock" to include fish; expanding the definition of "sexual act with an animal" to include intrusion or penetration into an animal's anus or genitals with an object or part of a person's body and allowing an exception only for care to improve the animal's health and eliminating the existing exception for animal husbandry practices; defining the "natural lifespan" for certain species of livestock and providing that slaughtering those animals is not animal cruelty if done according to acceptable animal husbandry practices after the animal has lived 1/4 of the natural lifespan; removing several exceptions to the animal cruelty statutes, including exceptions for animal husbandry; and providing that, in case of a conflict, the cruelty to animals statutes supersede statutes concerning animal care.

Likewise, the ballot title and submission clause as designated and fixed by the Board is as follows:

Shall there be a change to the Colorado Revised Statutes concerning expanding prohibitions against cruelty to animals, and, in connection therewith, expanding the definition of "livestock" to include fish; expanding the definition of "sexual act with an animal" to include intrusion or penetration into an animal's anus or genitals with an object or part of a person's body and allowing an exception only for care to improve the animal's health and eliminating the existing exception for animal husbandry practices; defining the "natural lifespan" for certain species of livestock and providing that slaughtering those animals is not animal cruelty if done according to acceptable animal husbandry practices after the animal has lived 1/4 of the natural lifespan; removing several exceptions to the animal cruelty statutes, including exceptions for animal husbandry; and providing that, in case of a conflict, the cruelty to animals statutes supersede statutes concerning animal care?

II. <u>GROUNDS FOR RECONSIDERATION</u>

A. The Title omits material features of the Initiative, does not fairly and accurately represent the Initiative's true intent and meaning, and may confuse and mislead voters.

A measure's title and submission clause must "correctly and fairly express the true intent and meaning" of the measure. See C.R.S. § 1-40-106(3)(b). The title and submission clause should enable the electorate, whether familiar or unfamiliar with the subject matter of a particular proposal, to determine intelligently whether to support or oppose such a proposal. In re Title, Ballot Title & Submission Clause for 2009-2010 No. 45, 234 P.3d 642, 648 (Cob. 2010). "[A] material omission can create misleading titles." In re Title, Ballot and Submission Clause 1999-2000 #258A, 4 P.3d 1094, 1098 (Cob. 2000).

The Title fails to adequately advise voters as to the circumstances under which individuals, including veterinarians, are subject to prosecution under the Initiative.

The initiative reads as follows:

"Sexual act with an animal" means an act between a person and an animal involving either direct physical contact between the genitals of one and the mouth, anus, or genitals of the other. SEXUAL ACT WITH AN ANIMAL ALSO INCLUDES ANY INTRUSION OR PENETRATION, HOWEVER SLIGHT, WITH AN OBJECT OR PART OF A PERSON'S BODY INTO AN ANIMAL'S ANUS OR GENITALS. A sexual act with an animal may be proven without allegation or proof of penetration. Nothing in this subjection (5) shall be construed to prohibit ANY PERSON FROM DISPENSING CARE TO AN ANIMAL IN THE INTEREST OF IMPROVING THAT ANIMAL'S HEALTH.

The language of the Title would lead a lay person to believe that the act in which the proposed amendments would seek to make criminal are those that would be objectionable to any reasonable person. What it does not clearly state is that common veterinary and animal husbandry practices, such as spaying, neutering, palpating, artificial insemination, correcting a breech baby, etc., would be considered a criminal act and subject to criminal sanctions.

The following changes should be made to the title:

A change to the Colorado Revised Statutes concerning expanding prohibitions against cruelty to animals, and, in connection therewith, expanding the definition of "livestock" to include fish; expanding the definition of "sexual act with an animal" to include intrusion or penetration into an animal's anus or genitals with an object or part of a person's body and allowing an exception only for care to improve the animal's health and eliminating the existing exception for animal husbandry practices <u>and veterinary</u> <u>practices such as spaying, neutering, artificial insemination, and breeding</u>; defining the "natural lifespan" for certain species of livestock and providing that slaughtering those animals is not animal cruelty if done according to acceptable animal husbandry practices after the animal has lived 1/4 of the natural lifespan; removing several exceptions to the animal cruelty statutes, including exceptions for animal husbandry; and providing that, in case of a conflict, the cruelty to animals statutes supersede statutes concerning animal care.

The following changes should be made to the title and submission clause:

Shall there be a change to the Colorado Revised Statutes concerning expanding prohibitions against cruelty to animals, and, in connection therewith, expanding the definition of "livestock" to include fish; expanding the definition of "sexual act with an animal" to include intrusion or penetration into an animal's anus or genitals with an object or part of a person's body and allowing an exception only for care to improve the animal's health and eliminating the existing exception for animal husbandry practices **and veterinary practices such as spaying, neutering, artificial insemination, and breeding**; defining the "natural lifespan" for certain species of livestock and providing that slaughtering those animals is not animal cruelty if done according to acceptable animal husbandry practices after the animal has lived 1/4 of the natural lifespan; removing several exceptions to the animal cruelty statutes, including exceptions for animal husbandry; and providing that, in case of a conflict, the cruelty to animals statutes supersede statutes concerning animal care?

B. The Initiative impermissibly addresses multiple subjects.

The Initiative addresses at least two separate and distinct subjects. It is therefore prohibited by article V, section 5 of the Colorado Constitution and the Board should decline to fix a title for it.

Each initiative that proposes an amendment to the State Constitution shall contain only one subject, clearly expressed in the title set for that initiative. See Cob. Const. Art. V., § 1(5.5) (the "Single Subject Rule"); see also C.R.S. § 1-40-106.5 (single-subject requirements for initiated measures); In re Title, Ballot Title, Submission Clause, 974 P.2d 458, 463 (Cob. 1999) (proposed initiative violates single subject rule where it "has at least two distinct and separate purposes which are not dependent upon or connected with each other.").

In the February 15, 2021 Memorandum from the Legislative Council staff and Office of Legislative Legal Services under "Purposes," it is stated:

The *major purposes* of the [Initiative] appear to be:

- 1. Update language in the criminal cruelty to animal statutes (sections 18-9-201, 18-9-201.5, and 18-9-202, Colorado Revised Statutes) to create greater protections for animals from suffering and exploitation by raising the standard of care; and
- 2. Extending certain portions of the criminal cruelty to animal statutes to include, in certain instances, livestock, and criminalizing actions that are currently considered legal animal husbandry practices.

Movants would agree that the two stated purposes are contained in the Initiative but would assert that there are two more purposes; the first of which would amend the language and requirements contained in Chapter 12 of Colorado Revised Statutes known as the Colorado Veterinary Practice Act. The Initiative seeks to amend what constitutes cruelty to animals and to prohibit individuals from performing certain practices. What is also does by inference is to prohibit current practices by licensed veterinarians which will result in potential criminal violations for practices which are currently allowed for and regulated through the Colorado Veterinary Practice Act. The second purpose is that it creates a new statutory criterion describing the lifespan of certain animals without any scientific basis which is arbitrary and capricious standards and could potentially be in violation of the interstate commerce doctrines.

Finally, the Initiative would override and contradict all the existing laws and regulations regarding fisheries and practices. This must be considered as a separate and distinct subject.

The Single Subject Rule prohibits attempts to roll together multiple subjects in order to attract the votes of those who would favor one of those subjects but would oppose the others. *See, e.g., In re Proposed Initiative for 2005-2006 #74, 136 P.3d 237. 242 (Colo. 2006); In re Proposed Initiative for 1997-1998 #84, 961 P.2d 456, 458 (Colo. 1998).* The Initiative combines the two subjects identified in the Memorandum with the additional purposes listed above, potentially attracting voters who might support changing what constitutes cruelty to animals but would not support limiting what is allowed by licensed veterinarians and livestock stewards for the care of all animals. Therefore, the Board should determine that the Initiative violates the Single Subject Rule and that a title cannot be set for it.

Respectfully submitted this 24th day of March, 2021 by the Movants indicated below. (Signature pages provided in counterparts.)

By the following MOVANTS: 11 RICHARD G FULTNER 288 ANIMAS VIEW RR Name: Address:

LOT 99 DURANGO, 81301

Name: Address:

Name:

Address:

Name:

Address: .

Name: Address:

Name: Address:

Name: Address:

Name: Address:

Name: Address:

By the following MOVANTS: Dan C. Peters Name: David C. Peters Address: 10 Kennebec Ct. Durango, Co. 81301

Name: Address:

Name: DALK KUGGLES Address: 1611 SKYVIEW RD BAYFIELD, CO 81122

Name: Address:

> Name: Address:

Name: Address:

Name: Address:

Name: Address:

Name: Address:

Name: Address:

By the following MOVANTS:

-ilista

Name: Address:

Name: Address:

Name: Address:

Name: Address:

Name: Address:

Name: Address:

Name: Address: Name: Heather gracio CO 8113'7 Address: 749 Name: Marian A. Tone Address: 1495 County Road 526 Bayfield CO 87122 5

By the following MOVANTS:

Name: Travis Oliger Address: 620 Sond ridge at Haspuras colo 81326

Name: Address:

Tim Karp 2991 CR 509 Bay Dield Colo 81122

Name: Colten Davig Address: 255 Thootev un #949cio Colo 81137

Name: Joseph C Lynn Address: 445 Railvoid Ave memos (0. 81328

Samuel Moling ame: 539 E. 5th St Durango CO 81301 Name: Address:

Paul Dunbar Name: 322 E Forrest Lakes dr Address: BayField, Co 81122

Michelle Architeta Name: Address: 1710 CR 318, Ighaino 8/137

David Roosth Name: Address: 291 Mornin, Star Dr Durango, Co 81303 Name:

Enim Madaer Name: Brian Mar Encantada Drango CO 81303 Address: 251 Mess nu

Name: Tyler Oliger Address: 620 SAND . RIDGE COURT

By the following MOVANTS:

Name: Mark 920 Address: 245 Legends Dr. Durange CO 81301

gnacio CO 8/137 Name: Address: 1710 CR 318,

Katherine Taugelchee me: 1710 CR 318 Ignacio CO 8/137 Name: Address: 1110

Name: Address:

Name: Address:

Name: Address:

Name: Address:

Name: Address:

Name: Address:

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that on the 24th day of March, 2021, a true and correct copy of the MOTION FOR REHEARING was filed with the Colorado Secretary of State and served via U.S. Mail, postage prepaid, to the following:

Alexander Sage P. O. Box 81 Broomfield, CO 80038

Brent Johannes P. O. Box 81 Broomfield, CO 80038

the Piley